Bethe-Salpeter equation: electron-hole excitations and optical spectra

Ilya Tokatly

European Theoretical Spectroscopy Facility (ETSF) NanoBio Spectroscopy Group - UPV/EHU San Sebastiàn - Spain IKERBASQUE, Basque Foundation for Science - Bilbao - Spain ilya.tokatly@ehu.es

TDDFT school - Benasque 2014





Universided Euskal Hemico del Psis Vaaco Universitace





Outline		

Optics and two-particle dynamics: Why BSE?

2 The Bethe-Salpeter equation: Pictorial derivation

- Macroscopic response and the Bethe-Salpeter equation
- 4 The Bethe-Salpeter equation in practice

Introduction		
Outline		

Optics and two-particle dynamics: Why BSE?

- 2 The Bethe-Salpeter equation: Pictorial derivation
- 3 Macroscopic response and the Bethe-Salpeter equation
- 4 The Bethe-Salpeter equation in practice

Introduction		
Historical remark		

Original Bethe-Salpeter equation

In 1951 [Phys. Rev. **84**, 1232 (1951)] Bethe and Salpeter derived an equation describing propagation of two interacting relativistic particles.

The physical motivation was the problem of deuteron – a bound state of two neucleons (proton and neutron in the nucleus of deuterium.)

Why this equation is so important in the theory of optical spectra?

Introduction		
Historical remark		

Original Bethe-Salpeter equation

In 1951 [Phys. Rev. **84**, 1232 (1951)] Bethe and Salpeter derived an equation describing propagation of two interacting relativistic particles.

The physical motivation was the problem of deuteron – a bound state of two neucleons (proton and neutron in the nucleus of deuterium.)

Why this equation is so important in the theory of optical spectra?

Optical absorption: Experiment and Phenomenology



Light is absorbed: $I = I_0 e^{-\alpha(\omega)x}$



 $\epsilon_M^{\prime\prime}(\omega)\sim {\rm absorption}$ rate

Elementary process of absorption: Photon creates a single e-h pair



Elementary process of absorption: Photon creates a single e-h pair





- photon creates an e-h pair
- the pair propagates freely
- it recombines and recreates a photon



- photon creates an e-h pair
- the pair propagates freely
- it recombines and recreates a photon



- photon creates an e-h pair
- the pair propagates freely
- it recombines and recreates a photon



- photon creates an e-h pair
- the pair propagates freely
- it recombines and recreates a photon

Elementary process of absorption: Photon creates a single e-h pair

Representation by Feynman diagrams:



- photon creates an e-h pair
- the pair propagates freely
- it recombines and recreates a photon

Absorption rate is given by an imaginary part of the polarization loop

$$W = \frac{2\pi}{\hbar} \sum_{i,j} |\langle \varphi_i | \mathbf{e} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{v}} | \varphi_j \rangle|^2 \delta(\varepsilon_j - \varepsilon_i - \hbar \omega) \sim \mathsf{Im}\epsilon(\omega)$$

Absorption by independent Kohn-Sham particles





Absorption by independent Kohn-Sham particles





Particles are interacting!

Interaction effects: self-energy corrections

1st class of interaction corrections:



Created electron and hole interact with other particles in the system, but do not touch each other

Interaction effects: self-energy corrections

1st class of interaction corrections:



Created electron and hole interact with other particles in the system, but do not touch each other

Absorption by "dressed" particles



Bare propagator G_0 is replaced by the full propagator $G = G_0 + G_0 \Sigma G$

$$[\omega - \hat{h}_0(\mathbf{r})]G(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', \omega) + \int d\mathbf{r}_1 \Sigma(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}_1, \omega)G(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}', \omega) = \delta(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}')$$

Self-energy corrections

Perturbative GW corrections

$$\hat{h}_0(\mathbf{r})\varphi_i(\mathbf{r}) + V_{xc}(\mathbf{r})\varphi_i(r) = \epsilon_i \varphi_i(\mathbf{r})$$

$$\hat{h}_0(\mathbf{r})\phi_i(\mathbf{r}) + \int d\mathbf{r}' \ \Sigma(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', \omega = E_i) \ \phi_i(\mathbf{r}') = E_i \ \phi_i(\mathbf{r})$$

First-order perturbative corrections with $\Sigma = GW$:

$$E_i - \epsilon_i = \langle \varphi_i | \Sigma - V_{xc} | \varphi_i \rangle$$

Hybersten and Louie, PRB **34** (1986); Godby, Schlüter and Sham, PRB **37** (1988)

Optical absorption: Independent quasiparticles



Interaction effects: vertex (excitonic) corrections

2nd class of interaction corrections:



includes all direct and indirect interactions between electron and hole created by a photon

Interaction effects: vertex (excitonic) corrections

2nd class of interaction corrections:



includes all direct and indirect interactions between electron and hole created by a photon

Summing up all such interaction processes we get:

Empty polarization loop is replaced by the full two-particle propagator $L(\mathbf{r}_1t_1;\mathbf{r}_2t_2;\mathbf{r}_3t_3;\mathbf{r}_4t_4) = L(1234)$ with joined ends

Interaction effects: vertex (excitonic) corrections

2nd class of interaction corrections:



includes all direct and indirect interactions between electron and hole created by a photon

Summing up all such interaction processes we get:



Empty polarization loop is replaced by the full two-particle propagator $L(\mathbf{r}_1t_1;\mathbf{r}_2t_2;\mathbf{r}_3t_3;\mathbf{r}_4t_4) = L(1234)$ with joined ends

Equation for L(1234) is the Bethe-Salpeter equation!

Introduction		
Absorption		



Neutral excitations \rightarrow poles of two-particle Green's function L Excitonic effects = electron - hole interaction

Introduction		
Absorption		



Neutral excitations \rightarrow poles of two-particle Green's function L Excitonic effects = electron - hole interaction

Introduction		
Absorption		



Neutral excitations \rightarrow poles of two-particle Green's function L Excitonic effects = electron - hole interaction

	BSE	
Outline		

Optics and two-particle dynamics: Why BSE?

- 2 The Bethe-Salpeter equation: Pictorial derivation
- 3 Macroscopic response and the Bethe-Salpeter equation
- 4 The Bethe-Salpeter equation in practice

Derivation of the Bethe-Salpeter equation (1)

Propagator of e-h pair in a many-body system:



Solid lines stand for bare one-particle Green's functions

$$G_0(12) = G_0(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2)$$

• Wiggled lines correspond to the interaction (Coulomb) potential

$$v(12) = v(\mathbf{r}_1 - \mathbf{r}_2)\delta(t_1 - t_2) = \frac{e^2}{|\mathbf{r}_1 - \mathbf{r}_2|}\delta(t_1 - t_2)$$

 Integration over space-time coordinates of all intermediate points in each graph is assumed

Derivation of the Bethe-Salpeter equation (1)

Propagator of e-h pair in a many-body system:



1st step: Dressing one-particle propagators \Rightarrow = \rightarrow + \rightarrow (Σ) \rightarrow + \rightarrow (Σ) \rightarrow + ...

Self-energy $\boldsymbol{\Sigma}$ is a sum of all 1-particle irreducible diagrams

Full 1-particle Green's function satisfies the Dyson equation

$$\implies$$
 = \rightarrow + \rightarrow Σ

	BSE	Response	
Derivation of	of the Bethe-Sa	lpeter equation (2)	

Propagation of dressed interacting electron and hole:



2nd step: Classification of scattering processes

At this stage we identify two-particle irreducible blocks



where $\gamma(1234)$ of the electron-hole stattering amplitude



Derivation of the Bethe-Salpeter equation (3)

Final step: Summation of a geometric series



The result is the Bethe-Salpeter equation





Derivation of the Bethe-Salpeter equation (3)

Final step: Summation of a geometric series



The result is the Bethe-Salpeter equation

Analytic form of the Bethe-Salpeter equation $(j = {\mathbf{r}_j, t_j})$

$$\begin{split} L(1234) &= L_0(1234) + \\ &\int L_0(1256) [v(57)\delta(56)\delta(78) - \gamma(5678)] L(7834) d5d6d7d8 \end{split}$$

Closed set of equations in a diagrammatic form

• 1-particle Green's function G(12) satisfies the Dyson equation



• $\Sigma(12)$ is a sum of all 1-particle irreducible diagrams

• $\gamma(1234)$ – sum of all e-h and interaction irreducible diagrams



	Response	
Outline		

- Optics and two-particle dynamics: Why BSE?
- 2 The Bethe-Salpeter equation: Pictorial derivation
- Macroscopic response and the Bethe-Salpeter equation
- 4 The Bethe-Salpeter equation in practice

Response to external potential

$$V^{ext} \longmapsto n^{ind} \longmapsto V^{ind}(\mathbf{r}) = \int d\mathbf{r}' v(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}') n^{ind}(\mathbf{r}') = v n^{ind}$$

Total field acting on particles in the system : $V^{tot} = V^{ext} + V^{ind}$

Linear response theory: Definition of the dielectric function

$$n^{ind}(1) = \int d2\chi(12)V^{ext}(2) \quad \longmapsto \quad V^{tot} = (1+v\chi)V^{ext} \equiv \epsilon^{-1}V^{ext}$$

The density response function $\chi(12)$ is related to the e-h propagator L

$$n^{ind} = L$$

$$\chi(12) = \chi(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2) = L(1122) = L(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2)$$

Optical absorption is determined by $Im \epsilon_M(\omega)$. How we calculate it?

$$V^{ext}(\mathbf{r},t) = V^{ext}(\mathbf{q})e^{-i(\omega t - \mathbf{qr})}, \qquad q \ll G$$

In a periodic system V^{ind} contains all components with $\mathbf{k} = \mathbf{q} + \mathbf{G}$

$$V^{ind}(\mathbf{r},t)=e^{-i\omega t}\sum_{\mathbf{G}}V_{\mathbf{G}}^{ind}(\mathbf{q})e^{i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\mathbf{r}}$$

Fourier component of the total potential in a solid:

$$V_{\mathbf{G}}^{tot}(\mathbf{q}) = \delta_{\mathbf{G},0} V^{ext}(\mathbf{q}) + V_{\mathbf{G}}^{ind}(\mathbf{q}) = \left[\delta_{\mathbf{G},0} + v_{\mathbf{G}}(\mathbf{q})\chi_{\mathbf{G},0}(\mathbf{q},\omega)\right] V^{ext}(\mathbf{q})$$

Macroscopic field and macroscopic dielectric function

- Macroscopic (averaged) potential: $V_M^{tot}(\mathbf{q}) = V_{\mathbf{G}=0}^{tot}(\mathbf{q})$
- Macroscopic dielectric function: $V^{ext}(\mathbf{q}) = \epsilon_M(\mathbf{q}, \omega) V_M^{tot}(\mathbf{q})$

$$\epsilon_M(\mathbf{q},\omega) = \frac{1}{1 + v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q})\chi_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega)}$$

Macroscopic dielectric function from BSE (1)

1st possibility:

• Calculate L(1234) by solving the Bethe-Salpeter equation

$$L = L_0 + L_0(v - \gamma)L$$

Join electron-hole ends and perform a Fourier transform in time

 $L(1122) = L(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2) \mapsto L(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2, \omega) = \chi(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \omega)$

Go to the momentum representation

$$\chi_{\mathbf{G},\mathbf{G}'}(\mathbf{q},\omega) = \int d\mathbf{r}_1 d\mathbf{r}_2 e^{i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\mathbf{r}_1} L(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2,\omega) e^{-i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G}')\mathbf{r}_2}$$

• The "head" of $\chi_{\mathbf{G},\mathbf{G}'}$ (element with $\mathbf{G} = \mathbf{G}' = 0$) determines ϵ_M

Macroscopic dielectric function from BSE (1)

1st possibility:

• Calculate L(1234) by solving the Bethe-Salpeter equation

$$L = L_0 + L_0(v - \gamma)L$$

Join electron-hole ends and perform a Fourier transform in time

 $L(1122) = L(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2) \mapsto L(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2, \omega) = \chi(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \omega)$

Go to the momentum representation

$$\chi_{\mathbf{G},\mathbf{G}'}(\mathbf{q},\omega) = \int d\mathbf{r}_1 d\mathbf{r}_2 e^{i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\mathbf{r}_1} L(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2,\omega) e^{-i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G}')\mathbf{r}_2}$$

• The "head" of $\chi_{\mathbf{G},\mathbf{G}'}$ (element with $\mathbf{G} = \mathbf{G}' = 0$) determines ϵ_M

Macroscopic dielectric function and the absorption rate

$$\epsilon_M(\mathbf{q},\omega) = \frac{1}{1 + v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q})\chi_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega)}; \qquad Abs(\omega) = \lim_{\mathbf{q}\to 0} \epsilon''_M(\mathbf{q},\omega)$$

Macroscopic dielectric function from BSE (2)

2nd possibility:

Define a "long-range part" v_0 of the interaction potential

$$v_{\mathbf{G}}(\mathbf{q}) = v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q})\delta_{\mathbf{G},0} + \bar{v}_{\mathbf{G}}(\mathbf{q})$$
$$v(r) = \int_{BZ} d\mathbf{q} \sum_{\mathbf{G}} e^{i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\mathbf{r}} v_{\mathbf{G}}(\mathbf{q}) = v_0(\mathbf{r}) + \bar{v}(\mathbf{r})$$

Bethe-Salpeter equation for a "proper" e-h propagator $\overline{L}(1234)$ (replace $v \mapsto \overline{v}$ in the full BSE)

$$\bar{L} = L_0 + L_0(\bar{v} - \gamma)\bar{L}$$

The full *L*-function and the density response function $\chi_{\mathbf{G},\mathbf{G}'}(\mathbf{q},\omega)$

$$L = \bar{L} + \bar{L}v_0L \quad \Rightarrow \quad \chi = \bar{\chi} + \bar{\chi}v_0\chi$$

Macroscopic dielectric function from BSE (2)

$$L = \bar{L} + \bar{L}v_0L \quad \Rightarrow \quad \chi(12) = \bar{\chi}(12) + \bar{\chi}(13)v_0(34)\chi(42)$$

In the momentum representation $v_0 \mapsto v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q}) \delta_{\mathbf{G},0}$

$$\chi_{\mathbf{G},\mathbf{G}'} = \bar{\chi}_{\mathbf{G},\mathbf{G}'} + \bar{\chi}_{\mathbf{G},0} v_{\mathbf{G}=0} \chi_{0,\mathbf{G}'} \quad \Rightarrow \quad \chi_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega) = \frac{\bar{\chi}_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega)}{1 - v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q})\bar{\chi}_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega)}$$

Macroscopic dielectric function in terms of proper polarizability

$$\epsilon_M(\mathbf{q},\omega) = \frac{1}{1 + v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q})\chi_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega)} = 1 - v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q})\bar{\chi}_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega)$$
$$\bar{\chi}_{0,0}(\mathbf{q},\omega) = \int d\mathbf{r}_1 d\mathbf{r}_2 e^{i\mathbf{q}(\mathbf{r}_1 - \mathbf{r}_2)}\bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_2,\omega)$$

Macroscopic dielectric function from BSE (2)

Optical response from the Bethe-Salpeter equation

• Solve the reduced Bethe-Salpeter equation for $\bar{L}(1234)$

$$\bar{L} = L_0 + L_0(\bar{v} - \gamma)\bar{L}$$

• Calculate the macroscopic dielectric function from $\bar{L}(1122)$

$$\epsilon_M(\mathbf{q},\omega) = 1 - v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q}) \int d\mathbf{r}_1 d\mathbf{r}_2 e^{i\mathbf{q}(\mathbf{r}_1 - \mathbf{r}_2)} \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1 \mathbf{r}_1 \mathbf{r}_2 \mathbf{r}_2, \omega)$$

• Calculate the absorption rate from the imaginary part of $\epsilon_M(\mathbf{q},\omega)$

$$Abs(\omega) = \lim_{\mathbf{q} \to 0} \epsilon''_M(\mathbf{q}, \omega)$$

By setting $\bar{v} = 0$ we neglect local field effects – the difference between the macroscopic field $V_M^{tot}(\mathbf{r})$ and the actual field $V^{tot}(\mathbf{r})$

		In practice
Outline		

- Optics and two-particle dynamics: Why BSE?
- 2 The Bethe-Salpeter equation: Pictorial derivation
- 3 Macroscopic response and the Bethe-Salpeter equation
- 4 The Bethe-Salpeter equation in practice

Reminder

BSE determines 2-particle propagator L(1234), provided 1-particle self-energy $\Sigma(12)$ and e-h scattering amplitude $\gamma(1234)$ are given.

Standard approximations:

• Appriximating Σ by GW diagram: $\Sigma(12) = G(12)W(12)$



• Approximating γ by W: $\gamma(1234) = W(12)\delta(13)\delta(24)$

$$\gamma$$
 =

Approximate Bethe-Salpeter equation

Analytic form of the approximate Bethe-Salpeter equation

$$L(1234) = L_0(1234) + \int L_0(1256)[v(57)\delta(56)\delta(78) - W(56)\delta(57)\delta(68)]L(7834)d5d6d7d8$$

 $L_0(1234) = G(12)G(43)$ and W(12) come out of the GW calculations

Reduced BSE for the proper e-h propagator

$$L(1234) = L_0(1234) + \int d5d6d7d8L_0(1256) \times \\ \times [v(57)\delta(56)\delta(78) - W(56)\delta(57)\delta(68)]L(7834)$$

Further simplifications: Static W

Assumption of the static screening:

 $W(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2) \Rightarrow W(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2) \delta(t_1 - t_2)$ $\bar{L}(1234) \Rightarrow \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \mathbf{r}_3, \mathbf{r}_4, t - t') \Rightarrow \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \mathbf{r}_3, \mathbf{r}_4, \omega)$

Reduced BSE for the proper e-h propagator

$$\bar{\boldsymbol{L}}(1234) = L_0(1234) + \int d5d6d7d8L_0(1256) \times \\ \times [\bar{\boldsymbol{v}}(57)\delta(56)\delta(78) - W(56)\delta(57)\delta(68)]\bar{\boldsymbol{L}}(7834)$$

Further simplifications: Static W

Assumption of the static screening:

 $W(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2) \Rightarrow W(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2) \delta(t_1 - t_2)$ $\bar{L}(1234) \Rightarrow \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \mathbf{r}_3, \mathbf{r}_4, t - t') \Rightarrow \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \mathbf{r}_3, \mathbf{r}_4, \omega)$

Reduced BSE for the proper e-h propagator

$$\bar{\boldsymbol{L}}(1234) = L_0(1234) + \int d5d6d7d8L_0(1256) \times \\ \times [\bar{\boldsymbol{v}}(57)\delta(56)\delta(78) - W(56)\delta(57)\delta(68)]\bar{\boldsymbol{L}}(7834)$$

Further simplifications: Static W

Assumption of the static screening:

$$W(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, t_1 - t_2) \Rightarrow W(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2) \delta(t_1 - t_2)$$

$$\bar{L}(1234) \Rightarrow \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \mathbf{r}_3, \mathbf{r}_4, t - t') \Rightarrow \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \mathbf{r}_3, \mathbf{r}_4, \omega)$$

BSE

Response

Optical response in practice

Calculation of the macroscopic dielectric function

$$\begin{split} \bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_{1}\mathbf{r}_{2}\mathbf{r}_{3}\mathbf{r}_{4}\omega) &= L_{0}(\mathbf{r}_{1}\mathbf{r}_{2}\mathbf{r}_{3}\mathbf{r}_{4}\omega) + \int d\mathbf{r}_{5}d\mathbf{r}_{6}d\mathbf{r}_{7}d\mathbf{r}_{8} \, L_{0}(\mathbf{r}_{1}\mathbf{r}_{2}\mathbf{r}_{5}\mathbf{r}_{6}\omega) \times \\ &\times [\bar{v}(\mathbf{r}_{5}\mathbf{r}_{7})\delta(\mathbf{r}_{5}\mathbf{r}_{6})\delta(\mathbf{r}_{7}\mathbf{r}_{8}) - W(\mathbf{r}_{5}\mathbf{r}_{6})\delta(\mathbf{r}_{5}\mathbf{r}_{7})\delta(\mathbf{r}_{6}\mathbf{r}_{8})]\bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_{7}\mathbf{r}_{8}\mathbf{r}_{3}\mathbf{r}_{4}\omega) \end{split}$$

$$\epsilon_M(\omega) = 1 - \lim_{\mathbf{q} \to 0} \left[v_{\mathbf{G}=0}(\mathbf{q}) \int d\mathbf{r} d\mathbf{r}' e^{i\mathbf{q}(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}')} \bar{L}(\mathbf{r},\mathbf{r},\mathbf{r}',\mathbf{r}',\omega) \right]$$

$$L_0(\mathbf{r}_1, \mathbf{r}_2, \mathbf{r}_3, \mathbf{r}_4, \omega) = \sum_{ij} (f_j - f_i) \frac{\phi_i^*(\mathbf{r}_1)\phi_j(\mathbf{r}_2)\phi_i(\mathbf{r}_3)\phi_j^*(\mathbf{r}_4)}{\omega - (E_i - E_j)}$$

		In practice
BSE calculations		

A three-step method

- LDA calculation \Rightarrow Kohn-Sham wavefunctions φ_i
- **GW calculation** \Rightarrow GW energies E_i and screened Coulomb interaction W
- BSE calculation

solution of $\bar{L} = L_0 + L_0(\bar{v} - \gamma)\bar{L}$

 \Rightarrow proper e-h propagator $\bar{L}(\mathbf{r}_1\mathbf{r}_2\mathbf{r}_3\mathbf{r}_4\omega)$

```
\Rightarrow spectra \epsilon_M(\omega)
```

Results: Continuum excitons (Si)



G. Onida, L. Reining, and A. Rubio, RMP 74 (2002).

Results: Bound excitons (solid Ar)





F. Sottile, M. Marsili, V. Olevano, and L. Reining, PRB 76 (2007).

		In practice
References		
Review articles:		

- Giovanni Onida, Lucia Reining, and Angel Rubio Rev. Mod. Phys. 74, 601 (2002).

G. Strinati

Rivista del Nuovo Cimento **11**, (12)1 (1988).

S. Botti, A. Schindlmayr, R. Del Sole, and L. Reining Rep. Progr. Phys. 70, 357 (2007).

PhD thesises:



🦫 Francesco Sottile

PhD thesis, Ecole Polytechnique (2003) http://etsf.polytechnique.fr/system/files/users/ francesco/Tesi dot.pdf



Fabien Bruneval

PhD thesis, Ecole Polytechnique (2005)

http://theory.polytechnique.fr/people/bruneval/ bruneval_these.pdf

		In practice
Thanks		

• Matteo Gatti for nice figures