

Winning topics

- A. Semiclassical origins of density functional approximations
- B. Strong correlation in DFT
- C. Using machine learning to find functionals
- D. Transport through molecules
- E. Density-corrected DFT (coming up)
- F. Warm dense matter
- G. Time-dependent density functional theory

Burke group



A. Semiclassical analysis

Jan 7, 2013

Semiclassical analysis and density functional theory

• Consider scaling to continuum limit:

$$v^{\zeta}(\mathbf{r}) = \zeta^{1+1/d} v(\zeta^{1/d}\mathbf{r}), \qquad N \to \zeta N.$$

where d is spatial dimension.

• Lieb and Simon (1973) proved that Thomas-Fermi theory is relatively exact as $\zeta \to \infty$, i.e.,

$$\frac{E^{\rm TF}-E_0}{E_0}\to 0$$

- Equivalent to changing Z = N for neutral atoms.
- Schwinger and Englert showed LDA exchange is relatively exact for atoms as $Z \to \infty$



Leading corrections to local approximations

- Can we define and find leading corrections to $E_{\rm XC}^{\rm LDA}$ in an expansion of the electronic energy as a function of particle number?
- Recent research has shown that at *least* for simple cases the answer is yes, but as explicit functionals of the *potential*, not density

Toy model: SNIFs

Same-spin NonInteracting Fermions

- no internal interactions
- Pauli Principle: Occupy lowest N levels

Also limit to

- one dimension
- Dirichlet boundary conditions (box)
- Arbitrary (but smooth) potential v(x)

Semiclassical analysis of SNIFS

WKB theory for bound states

$$\phi_j^{\text{WKB}}(x) = \frac{A}{\sqrt{k_j(x)}} \sin\theta_j(x)$$
$$k_j(x) = \sqrt{2(E_j - V(x))}$$
$$\theta_j(x) = \int_0^x k_j(x') dx'$$
$$\Theta_j(E_j) = \int_0^L k_j(x') dx' = j\pi$$

Semiclassics of sums over levels

$$n^{\rm sc}(x) = n^{\rm TF}(x) + n^{\rm osc}(x)$$
$$n^{\rm sc}(x) = \frac{k_F(x)}{\pi} - \frac{\sin 2\theta_F(x)}{2k_F(x)\tau_F(x)\sin[\alpha_F(x)]}$$
$$k_F(x) = \sqrt{E_F - V(x)}$$
$$\Theta_F(E_F) = \int_0^L k_F(x')dx' = \left(N + \frac{1}{2}\right)\pi$$
$$t_F(x) = \int_0^x \frac{dx'}{k_F(x')}$$

Properties of semiclassical density

$$n^{ ext{semi}}(x) = rac{k_{ ext{F}}(x)}{\pi} - rac{\sin 2 heta_{ ext{F}}(x)}{2 au_{ ext{F}}(L) k_{ ext{F}}(x) \sin\left(rac{\pi au_{ ext{F}}(x)}{ au_{ ext{F}}(L)}
ight)},$$

- Exact for v = 0, flat box.
- $\theta_{\rm F}(L) = 0$ required to make n(L) vanish, but does not imply normalization.
- Highly non-local functional via $E_{\rm F}$, and integrals of local functionals $\theta_{\rm F}(x)$ and $\tau_{\rm F}(x)$.
- TF theory retains only first term, $E_{\rm F}$ different.
- Only valid for $E_{\rm F} > v_{max}$, but works even if low-lying orbitals have turning points.

Bumpy box



- Choose double bump: $v(x) = -80 \sin^2(2\pi x/L)$.
- Orbital energies: -46, -42, 10, 37, so almost degenerate first and second levels.

Density in bumpy box



- Test quality of n(x) by inserting into T^{loc}[n] and find:
 Self-consistent TF (local approx) yields 115.
- Exact answer is 153.0.

Semiclassical density in bumpy box



- Norm error < 0.2%.
- Test quality of n(x) by inserting into $T^{loc}[n]$ and find:
- Self-consistent TF (local approx) yields 115.
- Semiclassical approximation yields 151.4.
- Exact answer is 153.0.

Latest preliminary results





Jan 7, 2013

Benasque IV

Exchange holes in Ne



Jones and Gunnarsson, Reviews of Modern Physics, Vol. 61, No. 3, July 1989

Jan 7, 2013

Benasque IV



Semiclassical results for 1d x hole

















Papers (formalism)

- Semiclassical Origins of Density Functionals, Peter Elliott, Donghyung Lee, Attila Cangi, KB, Phys. Rev. Lett. 100, 256406 (2008)
- Leading corrections to local approximations, Attila Cangi, Donghyung Lee, Peter Elliott, KB, Phys. Rev. B 81, 235128 (2010).
- Electronic Structure via Potential Functional Approximations, Attila Cangi, Donghyung Lee, Peter Elliott, KB, E. K. U. Gross, Phys. Rev. Lett. 106, 236404 (2011)
- Potential functionals versus density functionals, Attila Cangi, E. K. U. Gross, KB, to appear Phys. Rev. A (2013).
- Semiclassical density from parition function, A. Cangi and E. Sim.
- Semiclassical exchange energies, A. Cangi, P. Elliott, E.K.U. Gross.
- Semiclassical density for finite wells, R. Ribeiro.
- Semiclassical densities in quasi-2D systems, S. Pitallis, A. Cangi
- Orbital-free orbital energies, A. Cangi, E.K.U. Gross.

Papers (more practical)

- Relevance of the slowly varying electron gas... J. Perdew, L Constantin, E Sagvolden, KB, Phys. Rev. Lett. 97, 223002 (2006)
- Restoring the Density-Gradient Expansion for Exchange in Solids and Surfaces, J.P. Perdew et al. Phys. Rev. Lett. 100, 136406 (2008).
- Non-empirical derivation of the parameter in the B88 exchange functional, Peter Elliott, KB, Can J Chem 87, 1485-1491 (2009)
- Condition on the Kohn-Sham kinetic energy and .., D Lee, L Constantin, J Perdew, KB, J. Chem. Phys. 130, 034107 (2009)
- Ionization potentials in the limit of large atomic number, L Constantin, J Snyder, J Perdew, KB, J Chem Phys 133, 241103 (2010).
- ———————————————————————
- Ionization potentials and exchange energies for Bohr atoms, J. Snyder, S. Pitallis.
- Correlation energy in semiclassical limit, S. Pitallis.



on the density of Fig. 2.

Warm dense matter

- Much interest in performing DFT calculations at high pressure and temperature
- Do we need thermal corrections to XC?
- What are the rules?
- Book chapter → on our website.

PRL 107. 163001 (2011) PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

week ending 14 OCTOBER 2011

Exact Conditions in Finite-Temperature Density-Functional Theory

S. Pittalis, ^{1,2,3,*} C. R. Proetto, ^{2,3,4,†} A. Floris, ^{2,3,‡} A. Sanna, ^{3,4} C. Bersier, ^{3,4} K. Burke, ⁵ and E. K. U. Gross^{3,4} ¹Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Missouri–Columbia, Columbia, Missouri 65211, USA ²Institut für Theoretische Physik, Freie Universität Berlin, Arnimallee 14, D-14195 Berlin, Germany ³European Theoretical Spectroscopy Facility (ETSF) ⁴Max-Planck-Institut für Mikrostrukturphysik, Weinberg 2, D-06120 Halle, Germany ⁵Department of Chemistry, University of California, Irvine, California 92697, USA (Received 9 March 2011; published 12 October 2011)

Density-functional theory (DFT) for electrons at finite temperature is increasingly important in condensed matter and chemistry. The exact conditions that have proven crucial in constraining and constructing accurate approximations for ground-state DFT are generalized to finite temperature, including the adiabatic connection formula. We discuss consequences for functional construction.

vert the sense of Eq. (17), we can write:

$$F_{\rm s}^{\tau'}[n] = \frac{\tau'}{\tau} F_{\rm s}^{\tau}[n_{\sqrt{\tau/\tau'}}],$$
 (19)

i.e., knowledge of $F_{s}^{\tau}[n]$ at any one finite τ generates *its* entire temperature dependence. via scaling. Furthermore.

Thermal Density Functional Theory in Context

Aurora Pribram-Jones, Stefano Pittalis, E.K.U. Gross, and Kieron Burke

Jan 7, 2013

'True' self-interaction error

Anions

Barriers



FIG. 1: Comparison of KS potentials of Li⁻. The black line is essentially exact, using a density from quantum Monte Carlo. The red (dashed) line is the LDA potential on that density. The horizontal lines mark the HOMO (2s orbital) energies.



Crazy Hemibonds in solution



Figure 2. Hemiboaded (ClOH)–(H_O), (left) and H-bonded OHCl⁻⁺(H_2O), (right) cluster geometries observed in simulations without and with the SIC, respectively. Water oxygens are depicted in blue, OH oxygen in red, hydrogens in white, and chlorine in yellow, and the gray spheres represents the WFCs (see text).

Understanding and reducing errors in density functional calculations Min-Cheol Kim, Eunji Sim, Kieron Burke, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 073003 (2013).

Dissociating H₂⁺



Elongated molecules



Jan 7, 2013

Benasque IV

B. Strong correlation

Jan 7, 2013

Errors in standard DFT approximations



32

Jan 3, 2014

DMRG

- Extremely efficient exact solver for 1d problems
- Traditionally applied to model Hamiltonians, e.g., 2000 site Hubbard chain
- Works well when correlation is so strong that nothing starting from HF can work.

Basic ingredients

```
Ideas for correcting these issues,
but how to test them? S-DFA
HSE DMFT+DFT
GGA+U
```

To check if they work, and for the right reasons, must give something up:

- Continuum
- Long-range interactions
- Three Dimensions

Using an exact numerical solver for 1d systems (known as DMRG), we can learn more about density functional theory (DFT) and find ways to make it better

From Miles



Three levels of activity

Three levels of application to DFT:



Easier

More Difficult

Level I: compare exact results to DFT approximations

Level II: study the exact Kohn-Sham system

Level III: self-consistent KS calculation with the exact functional



Jan 3, 2014

Oviedo

Example of long chains

DMRG powerful enough to solve a chain of 100 stretched soft Hydrogen atoms



Spontaneous dimerization

FIG. 2 (color online). Spontaneous dimerization of the density for a chain of 10 soft hydrogen atoms with interatomic spacing b = 4 (dashed lines are a guide to the eye). The upper panel compares the densities predicted by DFT within the LSDA; the lower panel shows the spin densities for unrestricted LSDA. Also shown is the expectation value of the kinetic energy $\langle c_j^{\dagger} c_{j+1} + c_{j+1}^{\dagger} c_j \rangle$ for a Hubbard model with U/t = 4 and the exchange energy $\langle \mathbf{S}_j \cdot \mathbf{S}_{j+1} \rangle$ for the Heisenberg model on 10 lattice sites. The thickness of the lines indicates the magnitude of these quantities on each bond.





Mott-Hubbard gap



FIG. 3 (color online). Exact gaps for chains of N soft hydrogen atoms with atomic separation b = 4 (error bars are less than symbol sizes). The upper curve is a quadratic fit of exact gaps of the largest six systems and extrapolates to a finite value $E_g \approx$ 0.33. The exact Kohn-Sham gaps, in contrast, extrapolate to zero showing that for $N \rightarrow \infty$ the true KS system is metallic (lower curve is a linear fit of exat KS gaps of the largest six systems).

BENCHMARKS





H₂

- Extract KS potential from exact density
- A non-interacting inversion



Cite this: Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys., 2012, 14, 8581-8590

www.rsc.org/pccp

PAPER

Reference electronic structure calculations in one dimension[†]

Lucas O. Wagner,*^a E. M. Stoudenmire,^a Kieron Burke^{ab} and Steven R. White^a

Received 24th December 2011, Accepted 1st May 2012 DOI: 10.1039/c2cp24118h

Large strongly correlated systems provide a challenge to modern electronic structure methods, because standard density functionals usually fail and traditional quantum chemical approaches are too demanding. The density-matrix renormalization group method, an extremely powerful tool for solving such systems, has recently been extended to handle long-range interactions on real-space grids, but is most efficient in one dimension where it can provide essentially arbitrary accuracy. Such Id systems therefore provide a theoretical laboratory for studying strong correlation and developing density functional approximations to handle strong correlation, *if* they mimic three-dimensional reality sufficiently closely. We demonstrate that this is the case, and provide reference data for exact and standard approximate methods, for future use in this area.

Fig. 1 The KS potential for a stretched hydrogen molecule found from interacting electrons in 1d.

LDA for soft Coulomb

 Get uniform gas inputs from QMC for 1d soft-Coulomb gas, by Nicole Helbig et al



Fig. 2 Parametrization of the LDA exchange and exchange–correlation energy densities per electron for polarized $\zeta = 1$ and unpolarized $\zeta = 0$ densities.¹⁸

Comparing 1d and 3d



Fig. 4 The exact KS potential for a model helium density found from interacting electrons in 1d, as well as the LDA density and LDA KS potential found self-consistently.

Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys., 2012, 14, 8581–8590 | 8585

Table 3 Exact and HF two-electron atoms and ions, in 1- and 3-d (exact data from ref. 20, Li^+ is fit quadratically to surrounding elements, and HF data from ref. 36 and 37)

System	Т	V	V _{ee}	Ε	$E^{\rm HF}$	$E_{\rm C}^{\rm QC}$
H-	0.115	-1.326	0.481	-0.731	-0.692	-0.039
He	0.290	-3.219	0.691	-2.238	-2.224	-0.014
Li	0.433	-5.084	0.755	-3.896	-3.888	-0.008
Be ⁺⁺	0.556	-6.961	0.790	-5.615	-5.609	-0.006
3d H ⁻	0.528	-1.367	0.311	-0.528	-0.488	-0.042
3d He	2.904	-6.753	0.946	-2.904	-2.862	-0.042
3d Li ⁺	7.280	-16.13	1.573	-7.280	-7.236	-0.043
$3d Be^{++}$	13.66	-29.50	2.191	-13.66	-13.61	-0.044

This journal is © the Owner Societies 2012

Jan 3, 2014

Oviedo

Classic DFT errors



Fig. 8 The binding energy curve for our 1d model H_2^+ , shown with an absolute energy scale, and with nuclear separation *R*; horizontal dashed lines indicate the energy of a single H atom.

-1.2 $(\mathbf{x})^{-1.3}$ -1.4 $(\mathbf{x})^{-1.4}$ $(\mathbf{x})^{-1.4}$

Fig. 9 The binding energy curve for our 1d model H_2 , shown on an absolute energy scale, with nuclear separation R. Dashed curves represent unrestricted calculations.

View Onli

CONVERGENCE



Interacting inversion



FIG. 2. Arbitrary density inversion for non-interacting and interacting potentials.

Oviedo

KS with exact XC



FIG. 3. To determine the $E_{\text{HXC}}[n]$ and $v_{\text{HXC}}[n](\mathbf{r})$: Our exact calculation requires a computationally demanding inversion algorithm to find the one-body potential $v[n](\mathbf{r})$ of the interacting system whose density is $n(\mathbf{r})$, in addition to a noninteracting inversion to find $v_{\text{S}}[n](\mathbf{r})$. In case of degeneracy, mixed-states should be used instead of pure-state wavefunctions in both non-interacting and interacting inversions [5, 51].

Definitions

- n(r) is some given density
- n'(r) is output from one KS step
- λ is a mixing parameter
- η is a measure of closeness of 2 densities
- ΔE is energy above true ground-state

$$n_{\lambda}(\mathbf{r}) = (1 - \lambda)n(\mathbf{r}) + \lambda n'(\mathbf{r}),$$

 $\eta \equiv \frac{1}{N^2} \int d^3r (n'(\mathbf{r}) - n(\mathbf{r}))^2.$

One KS step

FIG. 1 (color online). (a) The input and output densities for a single step of the Kohn-Sham scheme, as well as the exact density, of a one-dimensional, strongly correlated four atom, four electron system. (b) The energy of the system which interpolates between the input and output densities $E_v[n_\lambda]$, measured from the ground-state energy E_v^{gs} . Also shown is the linear-response approximation with slope given by Eq. (12).



Convergence of chain



FIG. 2 (color online). KS procedure for a moderately correlated four-electron system (four hydrogen atoms with R = 3), showing the first few iterations. Using a fixed $\lambda = 0.30$, we converge to $\eta < 10^{-6}$ using Eq. (4) within 13 iterations.

Rate of convergence

$$\eta \equiv \frac{1}{N^2} \int d^3 r (n'(\mathbf{r}) - n(\mathbf{r}))^2$$

$$n_{\lambda}(\mathbf{r}) = (1 - \lambda)n(\mathbf{r}) + \lambda n'(\mathbf{r}),$$



FIG. 3 (color online). Differences in the density η using Eq. (4) and the energy with $\Delta E = E_{\nu}[n'] - E_{\nu}^{gs}$, for an H₂ molecule with (a) R = 1.6 and (b) R = 3. In (b), the ΔE curves are omitted for clarity, but are like those in (a).

Spin polarization

week ending 30 AUGUST 2013

PRL 111, 093003 (2013)

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

Guaranteed Convergence of the Kohn-Sham Equations

Lucas O. Wagner,^{1,2} E. M. Stoudenmire,¹ Kieron Burke,^{1,2} and Steven R. White¹ ¹Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of California, Irvine, California 92697, USA ²Department of Chemistry, University of California, Irvine, California 92697, USA (Received 13 May 2013; revised manuscript received 31 July 2013; published 28 August 2013)

A sufficiently damped iteration of the Kohn-Sham (KS) equations with the exact functional is proven to always converge to the true ground-state density, regardless of the initial density or the strength of electron correlation, for finite Coulomb systems. We numerically implement the exact functional for one-dimensional continuum systems and demonstrate convergence of the damped KS algorithm. More strongly correlated systems converge more slowly.



FIG. 4 (color online). Starting an exact KS calculation of stretched H₂ with a spin-polarized density still converges (with $\lambda = 0.5$) to the correct spin-singlet density. For the same initial density, the KS calculation with the local spin-density (LSD) approximation [47] converges to the broken spin-symmetry solution shown.

LONG PAPER (in prep)

Jan 3, 2014

KS steps when weakly correlated



FIG. 6. A single step in the KS scheme for a weakly correlated system (H₄ with R = 2) away from two different initial densities: non-interacting electrons in the external potential (NI) and a pseudouniform electron density (PU). These initial densities are the dashed curves in (a) and (b), and the solid curves are the output densities for each KS step; for comparison the dotted curve is the exact density. The lower panel plots Eq. (22), the energy of the system as it interpolates from the input to the output density.

Oviedo

Single step for strong correlation



FIG. 7. A single step in the KS scheme for a strongly correlated system (H₄ with R = 4) away from two different initial densities: non-interacting electrons in the external potential (NI) and a pseudouniform electron density (PU). These initial densities are the dashed curves in (a) and (b), and the solid curves are the output densities for each KS step; for comparison the dotted curve is the exact density. The lower panel plots Eq. (22), the energy of the system as it interpolates from the input to the output density.

KS step when close to gs



FIG. 8. Taking a second step in the KS scheme for a strongly correlated system (H₄ with R = 4). Panel (a) shows the input density which is near to the exact density (the $\lambda = 42\%$ density of the NI input density of Fig. 7) and the resulting output density, which is far from the ground-state. The lower panel (b) plots Eq. (22), and the inset (c) magnifies the small λ region.

Oviedo

No of iterations vs R



FIG. 10. The number of iterations required to converge an LDA calculation to $\eta < 10^{-8}$ (12), as a function of λ , for various bond-lengths R of the H₂ molecule, starting with an initial density of H^- on the left atom. The asymptotic form for small λ can be well-approximated by $7/\lambda$ for the data shown.

Oviedo

3

Convergence vs bond length



FIG. 11. Plotting the convergence-critical λ for an LDA calculation, as a function of the bond length R of a stretched hydrogen molecule, starting with the exact H⁻ density on one atom, as well as KS gaps for both the LDA and exact systems.

Oviedo

Transport through single molecules

- Are DFT calculations generally accurate for current?
- For weak bias and zero temperature, surprising answer is yes, but only with accurate XC
- Present XC approxs miss important steps in potential

PRL 108, 066801 (2012)	PHYSICAL	REVIEW	LETTERS	week ending 10 FEBRUARY 2012
Bethe Ansatz Ap	oproach to the Kond	lo Effect v	vithin Density-Fun	actional Theory
Departments of	Justin P. Bergfield, Zl Chemistry and Physics, Ur	hen-Fei Liu, niversity of Ca	and Kieron Burke lifornia, Irvine, Californ	ia 92697, USA
Department of Phy	Char sics, University of Arizona (Received 14 June 20	les A. Staffo , 1118 East F 11; published	rd Jourth Street, Tucson, Ari. 7 February 2012)	zona 85721, USA
Transport through is dominated by a F particle Kohn-Sham of a Kondo peak in i coupling strengths, i derivative discontinu	an Anderson junction (two Kondo peak in the spectral potential of density-function ts spectral function. Using neluding the crossover from ity. A simple and accurate	macroscopic of function at z onal theory rep Bethe ansatz t n mean-field bo interpolation	electrodes coupled to an A ero temperature. We she roduces the linear transpo echniques, we calculate the ehavior to charge quantize formula is also given.	Anderson impurity) ow that the single- ort, despite the lack his potential for all ation caused by the
DOI: 10.1103/PhysRev	Lett.108.066801	PACS nut	nbers: 73.63.Rt, 31.15.E-,	71.15.Mb, 72.15.Qm

$$\varepsilon_{\rm XC} \simeq \frac{U}{2} \bigg[1 - \langle n_{\rm C} \rangle - \frac{2}{\pi} \tan^{-1} \bigg[\frac{\pi^2 U (1 - \langle n_{\rm C} \rangle)}{8\Gamma} \bigg] \bigg],$$

Summary: semiclassics

- DFT is extremely popular because if it so powerful.
- Too much ambiguity in choice of approximation
- Semiclassical analysis holds hope of systematic approach with powerful new approximations.
- DFT works because LDA is semiclassical
- Thanks to NSF.

Summary: strong correlation

- Have a new tool for studying KS DFT in 1d, especially good for strong correlation.
- Relies on efficiency of DMRG in 1d.
- Have shown KS equations can always be made to converge
- Convergence slows with strength of correlation
- Thanks to US DOE for funding.