Entropic Measures in Quantum Phase Transitions: Dicke model

M. Calixto* (with A. Nagy, E. Romera & R. del Real)

*Departamento de Matemática Aplicada Universidad de Granada

Mathematical Structures in Quantum Systems and Applications Benasque: 9-13th of July 2012

Full Dicke Model Hamiltonian (R.H. Dicke 1954)

N two-level atoms (described by spin- $\frac{1}{2}$ Pauli operators $\sigma_{z,+,-}^{(i)}$) interacting (via dipole $\vec{E} \cdot \vec{D}$) with *M* radiation bosonic field modes ($a_{\alpha}, a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}$) within an ideal cavity. Atoms are separated, so that dipole-dipole $\vec{D} \cdot \vec{D}$ interactions are negligible.

$$H = \omega_0 \sum_{i=1}^N \sigma_z^{(i)} + \sum_{\alpha=1}^M \omega_\alpha \boldsymbol{a}_\alpha^{\dagger} \boldsymbol{a}_\alpha + \sum_{i=1}^N \sum_{\alpha=1}^M \frac{\lambda_\alpha}{\sqrt{N}} (\boldsymbol{a}_\alpha^{\dagger} + \boldsymbol{a}_\alpha) (\sigma_+^{(i)} + \sigma_-^{(i)})$$

 ω_0 : level spliting; ω_{α} : photon frequencies; λ_{α} : coupling constants (depend on the intensity of the cavity electric field \vec{E}). Basic commutation relations:

$$[\sigma_{z}^{(i)}, \sigma_{\pm}^{(j)}] = \pm \delta^{ij} \sigma_{\pm}^{(i)}, \ [\sigma_{+}^{(i)}, \sigma_{-}^{(j)}] = 2\delta^{ij} \sigma_{z}^{(i)}, \ [a_{lpha}, a_{eta}^{\dagger}] = \delta_{lphaeta}$$

Case of a single-mode radiation field M = 1

$$H = \omega_0 J_z + \omega a^{\dagger} a + \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{N}} (a^{\dagger} + a) (J_+ + J_-),$$

Collective atomic operators: $J_k = \sum_{i=1}^N \sigma_k^{(i)}, \ k = z, +, -$ Hilbert Space: Span{ $|n\rangle \otimes |j, m\rangle$ }

 $n = 0, ..., \infty$: number of photons, $a^{\dagger}a|n\rangle = n|n\rangle$ 2j = N: "number of atoms" (e^{iHt} does not mix *j* sectors) m = -j, ..., j: atomic sector $\rightarrow (N + 1)$ -level system m + j: number of excited atoms, $J_z|j, m\rangle = m|j, m\rangle$ $\hat{\mathcal{N}} = a^{\dagger}a + J_z + j$: total "excitation number"

Rotating Wave Approximation (valid for small λ) "Jaynes-Cummings Hamiltonian"

$$H_{RWA} = \omega_0 J_z + \omega a^{\dagger} a + \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{N}} (a^{\dagger} J_- + a J_+),$$

neglects the "counter-rotating" terms $a^{\dagger}J_{+}$ and aJ_{-} . This makes H_{RWA} integrable, simplifying the analysis but removing the posibility of caos. Dicke used this model to illustrate the importance of collective effects in the atom-light interaction, leading to the concept of super-radiance: the atomic ensemble spontaneously emits above $\lambda_{c}^{RWA} = \sqrt{\omega\omega_{0}}$ with an intensity $\propto N^{2}$, rather than $\propto N$ (incoherent radiation).

 $\hat{\mathcal{N}} = a^{\dagger}a + J_z + j$: is conserved in the RWA

Dicke Hamiltonian and parity

$$H = \omega_0 J_z + \omega a^{\dagger} a + \frac{\lambda}{\sqrt{N}} (a^{\dagger} + a) (J_+ + J_-),$$

Hilbert Space: Span{ $|n\rangle \otimes |j,m\rangle$ }, $n = \in \mathbb{N}, m = -j, \dots, j$

$$J_{\pm}|j,m\rangle = \sqrt{j(j+1) - m(m\pm 1)}|j,m\pm 1\rangle,$$

 $a^{\dagger}|n\rangle = \sqrt{n+1}|n+1\rangle, a|n\rangle = \sqrt{n}|n-1\rangle$
 $\hat{\mathcal{N}} = a^{\dagger}a + J_z + j$: counts the number of excitation quanta
Parity operator $P = e^{i\pi\hat{\mathcal{N}}}$ is conserved $[P,H] = 0$

and both operators can then be jointly diagonalized.

The matrix elements of the Hamiltonian in this basis are:

$$\langle n'; j, m' | H | n; j, m \rangle = (n\omega + m\omega_0) \delta_{n',n} \delta_{m',m}$$

 $+ rac{\lambda}{\sqrt{2j}} (\sqrt{n+1} \delta_{n',n+1} + \sqrt{n} \delta_{n',n-1})$
 $imes (\sqrt{j(j+1) - m(m+1)} \delta_{m',m+1})$
 $+ \sqrt{j(j+1) - m(m-1)} \delta_{m',m-1}).$

 $|n\rangle \otimes |j, m\rangle$ and $|n'\rangle \otimes |j, m'\rangle$ are connected by temporal evolution iff n + m + j and n' + m' + j have the same parity (even or odd) $e^{i\pi(n+m+j)}$: good quantum number. The ground state is even The following variational approximation to the ground state is usually considered:

$$|\alpha, \mathbf{z}\rangle = |\alpha\rangle \otimes |\mathbf{z}\rangle$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} |\alpha\rangle &= \mathbf{e}^{-|\alpha|^2/2} \mathbf{e}^{\alpha \mathbf{a}^{\dagger}} |0\rangle = \mathbf{e}^{-|\alpha|^2/2} \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{\alpha^n}{\sqrt{n!}} |n\rangle, \\ |z\rangle &= (1+|z|^2)^{-j} \mathbf{e}^{zJ_+} |j, -j\rangle = (1+|z|^2)^{-j} \sum_{m=-j}^{j} {\binom{2j}{j+m}}^{1/2} z^{j+m} |j, m\rangle, \end{aligned}$$

are the ordinary (canonical) and spin-*j* coherent states for the photon and the atom sectors, respectively.

Ground-State Energy Surface (for $N \to \infty$), Equilibrium Points and critical atom-field coupling strength: $\lambda_c = \frac{1}{2}\sqrt{\omega\omega_0}$

The equilibrium points

$$\alpha = \alpha_{0} = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_{c} \\ -\sqrt{N}\sqrt{\frac{\omega_{0}}{\omega}}\frac{\lambda}{\lambda_{c}}\sqrt{1 - \left(\frac{\lambda}{\lambda_{c}}\right)^{-4}}, & \text{if } \lambda \ge \lambda_{c} \\ 0, & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_{c} \text{ (normal phase)} \\ \sqrt{\frac{\frac{\lambda}{\lambda_{c}} - \left(\frac{\lambda}{\lambda_{c}}\right)^{-1}}{\frac{\lambda}{\lambda_{c}} + \left(\frac{\lambda}{\lambda_{c}}\right)^{-1}}} & \text{if } \lambda \ge \lambda_{c} \text{ (superradiant phase)} \end{cases}$$

minimize the energy surface ($z \equiv e^{-i\phi} \tan(\theta/2)$):

$$\begin{aligned} E(\alpha, \mathbf{z}) &= \langle \alpha, \mathbf{z} | \mathbf{H} | \alpha, \mathbf{z} \rangle \\ &= \omega |\alpha|^2 - \frac{1}{2} N \omega_0 \cos(\theta) + \sqrt{2N} \lambda \frac{\alpha + \alpha^*}{\sqrt{2}} \sin(\theta) \cos(\phi) \end{aligned}$$

Mean number of photons in the ground state:

$$\langle \alpha_0, \mathbf{z}_0 | \mathbf{a}^{\dagger} \mathbf{a} | \alpha_0, \mathbf{z}_0 \rangle = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_c \text{ (normal phase)} \\ |\alpha_0|^2, & \text{if } \lambda \ge \lambda_c \text{ (superradiant phase)} \end{cases}$$

Mean number of excited atoms in the ground state:

$$\langle \alpha_0, \mathbf{z}_0 | \mathbf{J}_{\mathbf{z}} + \mathbf{j} | \alpha_0, \mathbf{z}_0 \rangle = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_c \text{ (normal phase)} \\ N \frac{|\mathbf{z}_0|^2}{1 + |\mathbf{z}_0|^2}, & \text{if } \lambda \ge \lambda_c \text{ (superradiant phase)} \end{cases}$$

Holstein-Primakoff representation

$$H = \omega_0 J_z + \omega a^{\dagger} a + rac{\lambda}{\sqrt{N}} (a^{\dagger} + a) (J_+ + J_-),$$

Angular momentum operators *J* in terms of the bosonic operators, $[b, b^{\dagger}] = 1$ (*N* = 2*j*):

$$\begin{split} J_{+} &= b^{\dagger} \sqrt{N - b^{\dagger} b} = \sqrt{N} \, b^{\dagger} + O(1/N), \\ J_{-} &= \sqrt{N - b^{\dagger} b} \, b = \sqrt{N} \, b + O(1/N), \\ J_{z}/N &= (b^{\dagger} b - N/2)/N = -1/2 + O(1/N). \end{split}$$

Linear aproximation (valid in the thermodynamic limit $N \to \infty$)

$$H_{\infty} = \omega_0 b^{\dagger} b + \omega a^{\dagger} a + \lambda (a^{\dagger} + a) (b^{\dagger} + b),$$

two coupled oscillators (exactly integrable)

Ground state wave function in position and momentum

Position and momentum operators for the two bosonic modes:

$$egin{aligned} X &= rac{1}{\sqrt{2\omega}}(a^{\dagger}+a), \quad P_X &= i\sqrt{rac{\omega}{2}}(a^{\dagger}-a), \ Y &= rac{1}{\sqrt{2\omega_0}}(b^{\dagger}+b), \quad P_Y &= i\sqrt{rac{\omega_0}{2}}(b^{\dagger}+b), \end{aligned}$$

$$|\psi\rangle = \sum_{n=0}^{n_c} \sum_{m=-j}^{j} c_{nm}^{(j)} |n; j, m\rangle, \quad n_c: \text{ cutoff}$$

$$\psi(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}) = \sqrt{\omega\omega_0} e^{-\frac{1}{2}(\omega \mathbf{x}^2 + \omega_0 \mathbf{y}^2)} \sum_{n=0}^{n_c} \sum_{m=-j}^{j} c_{nm}^{(j)} \frac{H_n(\sqrt{\omega}\mathbf{x})H_{j+m}(\sqrt{\omega_0}\mathbf{y})}{2^{(n+m+j)/2}\sqrt{n!(j+m)!}}$$

$$\tilde{\psi}(p_x, p_y) = \frac{e^{-\frac{1}{2}(\frac{p_x^2}{\omega} + \frac{p_y^2}{\omega_0})}}{\sqrt{\omega\omega_0}} \sum_{n=0}^{n_c} \sum_{m=-j}^{j} \frac{c_{nm}^{(j)}}{(-i)^{-n-m-j}} \frac{H_n(\frac{p_x}{\sqrt{\omega}})H_{j+m}(\frac{p_y}{\sqrt{\omega_0}})}{2^{(n+m+j)/2}\sqrt{n!(j+m)!}}.$$



Figure: Ground state density function in position space (top) and momentum space (bottom) for different values of λ (from left to right $\lambda = 0.3$, $\lambda = 0.55$ and $\lambda = 0.7$) for $\omega_0 = \omega = 1$ and N = 20.

Uncertainty principle Variances diverge in the superradiant phase for $j \to \infty$



Manuel Calixto Entropic Measures in QPTs: Dicke model

500

Entropic Uncertainty of the Ground State Numerical calculations ($\lambda_c = 0.5$)

•

$$S_f \equiv -\int f(x,y) \ln f(x,y) dx dy, \ \
ho = |\psi|^2, \ \gamma = |\tilde{\psi}|^2$$



Not compatible with $|\alpha_0, z_0\rangle$, which gives constant entropy

$$4.29\simeq 2\ln(e\pi)\leq \mathcal{S}_
ho+\mathcal{S}_\gamma,$$

Symmetry-adapted CSs: Schrödiger catlike states

Ground (+) and first-excited (-) states (even and odd parity):

$$|\alpha, \mathbf{z}, \pm\rangle = \frac{|\alpha\rangle \otimes |\mathbf{z}\rangle \pm |-\alpha\rangle \otimes |-\mathbf{z}\rangle}{\mathcal{N}_{\pm}(\alpha, \mathbf{z})},$$

where \mathcal{N}_\pm is a normalization factor

$$\mathcal{N}_{\pm}(\alpha, z) = \sqrt{2} \left(1 \pm e^{-2|\alpha|^2} \left(\frac{1 - |z|^2}{1 + |z|^2} \right)^{2j} \right)^{1/2}$$

We shall use the fact that

$$\operatorname{Min}(\langle \alpha, \boldsymbol{z}, \pm | \boldsymbol{H} | \alpha, \boldsymbol{z}, \pm \rangle) \simeq \langle \alpha_{0}, \boldsymbol{z}_{0}, \pm | \boldsymbol{H} | \alpha_{0}, \boldsymbol{z}_{0}, \pm \rangle$$

far from λ_c , and the approximation $|z\rangle \simeq |\beta\rangle = e^{-|\beta|^2/2} e^{zb^{\dagger}} |0\rangle$ with $\beta = \sqrt{2j} z$ for $j \gg 1$

Even-Ground State Wave Function in Position and Momentum Representation

Taking into account the position and momentum representation of an ordinary (canonical) CS:

$$\langle \boldsymbol{x} | \boldsymbol{\alpha} \rangle = \left(\frac{\omega^2}{\pi} \right)^{1/4} \boldsymbol{e}^{i\sqrt{2\omega}\,\alpha_2 \boldsymbol{x}} \boldsymbol{e}^{-(\sqrt{\omega}\,\boldsymbol{x} - \sqrt{2}\,\alpha_1)^2/2},$$

$$\langle \boldsymbol{p} | \boldsymbol{\alpha} \rangle = \left(\frac{1}{\pi\omega^2} \right)^{1/4} \boldsymbol{e}^{i\sqrt{\frac{2}{\omega}}\,\alpha_1 \boldsymbol{p}} \boldsymbol{e}^{-(\frac{p}{\sqrt{\omega}} - \sqrt{2}\,\alpha_2)^2/2},$$

$$\begin{split} \psi(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}) &= \frac{\sqrt{\omega_0 \omega / \pi}}{\mathcal{N}_+(\alpha_0, \beta_0)} \left(e^{-\frac{1}{2}(\sqrt{\omega} \, \mathbf{x} - \sqrt{2} \, \alpha_0)^2 - \frac{1}{2}(\sqrt{\omega_0} \, \mathbf{y} - \sqrt{2} \, \beta_0)^2} \right. \\ &+ e^{-\frac{1}{2}(\sqrt{\omega} \, \mathbf{x} + \sqrt{2} \, \alpha_0)^2 - \frac{1}{2}(\sqrt{\omega_0} \, \mathbf{y} + \sqrt{2} \, \beta_0)^2} \right), \\ \tilde{\psi}(\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{x}}, \mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{y}}) &= \frac{2/\sqrt{\pi\omega_0 \omega}}{\mathcal{N}_+(\alpha_0, \beta_0)} e^{-\frac{p_{\mathbf{x}}^2}{2\omega} - \frac{p_{\mathbf{y}}^2}{2\omega_0}} \cos\left(\sqrt{2}(\frac{p_{\mathbf{x}}}{\sqrt{\omega}} \alpha_0 + \frac{p_{\mathbf{y}}}{\sqrt{\omega_0}} \beta_0)\right), \\ \text{where now } \mathcal{N}_+(\alpha_0, \beta_0) &= \left(2(1 + e^{-2\alpha_0^2 - 2\beta_0^2})\right)^{1/2}. \end{split}$$

Step Behavior of Entropy in the Thermodynamic Limit



$$\mathbf{S}_{\rho} + \mathbf{S}_{\gamma} = \begin{cases} \mathbf{S}^{\text{normal}} = \ln(\mathbf{e}\pi)^2 \simeq 4.29, & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_c \\ \mathbf{S}^{\text{super}} = \ln((2\pi)^2 \mathbf{e}) \simeq 4.68, & \text{if } \lambda \ge \lambda_c \end{cases}$$

포 > 표

$$R^{\mu}_{f}\equiv rac{1}{1-\mu}\ln\int f^{\mu}(\mathbf{r})d\mathbf{r}, \quad ext{for} \quad 0<\mu<\infty, \quad \mu
eq 1,$$

Hausdorff-Young inequality:

$$\begin{aligned} & R^{\mu}_{\rho} + R^{\nu}_{\gamma} \geq g(\mu,\nu), \quad \frac{1}{\mu} + \frac{1}{\nu} = 2\\ & g(\mu,\nu) = \frac{D}{2} \left[\frac{1}{\mu-1} \ln\left(\frac{\mu}{\pi}\right) + \frac{1}{\nu-1} \ln\left(\frac{\nu}{\pi}\right) \right], \end{aligned}$$

Rényi entropy in position and momentum representation

$$\begin{split} R^{\mu}_{\rho} \simeq \begin{cases} & \ln\left(\mu^{\frac{1}{\mu-1}}\pi\right), & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_{c} \\ & \ln\left(2\mu^{\frac{1}{\mu-1}}\pi\right), & \text{if } \lambda \geq \lambda_{c} \end{cases} \\ R^{\nu}_{\gamma} \simeq \begin{cases} & \ln\left(\nu^{\frac{1}{\nu-1}}\pi\right), & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_{c} \\ & \ln\left(\left(\frac{\Gamma(2\nu+1)}{\Gamma^{2}(\nu+1)2^{\nu}\nu}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-\nu}}\pi\right), & \text{if } \lambda \geq \lambda_{c} \end{cases} \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} \Delta x &= \sqrt{\frac{\frac{1}{2} + \frac{4\pi\alpha_0^2}{\mathcal{N}_+(\alpha_0,\beta_0)^2}}{\omega}}, \quad \frac{\Delta p_x}{\sqrt{\omega}} &= \sqrt{2\alpha_0^2(\frac{2\pi}{\mathcal{N}_+(\alpha_0,\beta_0)^2} - 1) + \frac{1}{2}}, \\ \Delta y &= \sqrt{\frac{\frac{1}{2} + \frac{4\pi\beta_0^2}{\mathcal{N}_+(\alpha_0,\beta_0)^2}}{\omega_0}}, \quad \frac{\Delta p_y}{\sqrt{\omega_0}} &= \sqrt{2\beta_0^2(\frac{2\pi}{\mathcal{N}_+(\alpha_0,\beta_0)^2} - 1) + \frac{1}{2}}. \end{split}$$

Ē▶ KĒ▶ -

æ

Numerical versus cat approximation, N = 20



æ

э

500

Entanglement

Ground state wave function (real)

$$\psi(\mathbf{x},\mathbf{y}) = \sum_{n=0}^{n_c} \sum_{m=-j}^{j} c_{nm}^{(j)} \phi_{n,m}(\mathbf{x},\mathbf{y}), \quad \langle \phi_{n,m} | \phi_{n',m'} \rangle = \delta_{n,n'} \delta_{m,m'}$$

Reduced density matrix:

$$\rho_1(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{x}') = \int d\boldsymbol{y} \psi(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y}) \psi(\boldsymbol{x}', \boldsymbol{y})$$

Purity:

$$\operatorname{Tr}(\rho_1^2) = \int \int d\mathbf{x} d\mathbf{x}' \rho_1(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') \rho_1(\mathbf{x}', \mathbf{x}) = \sum_{n,n'=0}^{n_c} \left(\sum_{m=-j}^{j} c_{nm}^{(j)} c_{n'm}^{(j)} \right)^2$$

ъ

Entanglement Linear Entropy $L_N(\lambda) = 1 - \text{Tr}(\rho_1^2)$



Husimi distribution

Husimi distribution of the basis (photon times Dicke) states:

$$\varphi_{n,m}^{(j)}(\alpha, \mathbf{z}) = \langle \mathbf{n} | \alpha \rangle \langle j, \mathbf{m} | \mathbf{z} \rangle = \frac{\mathbf{e}^{-|\alpha|^2/2} \alpha^n}{\sqrt{n!}} \frac{\sqrt{\binom{2j}{j+m}} \mathbf{z}^{j+m}}{(1+|\mathbf{z}|^2)^j}.$$

Husimi distribution of the ground state

$$\Psi(\alpha, \mathbf{z}) = |\langle \alpha, \mathbf{z} | \psi \rangle|^2$$

=
$$\sum_{n,n'=0}^{n_c} \sum_{m,m'=-j}^{j} c_{nm}^{(j)} \bar{c}_{n'm'}^{(j)} \varphi_{n,m}^{(j)}(\alpha, \mathbf{z}) \varphi_{n,m}^{(j)}(\bar{\alpha}, \bar{\mathbf{z}})$$

and normalized according to:

$$\frac{2j+1}{\pi^2}\int_{\mathbb{R}^4}\Psi(\alpha,z)d^2\alpha\frac{d^2z}{(1+|z|^2)^2}=1.$$

Moments and Rényi-Wehrl entropies

 ν -th moments of the Husimi distribution ($|z\rangle \simeq |\beta\rangle$, $\beta = \sqrt{2j}z$):

$$M_{j,\nu}(\lambda) = \int_{\mathbb{R}^4} \frac{d^2 \alpha d^2 \beta}{\pi^2} (\Phi(\alpha,\beta))^{\nu} \stackrel{j \to \infty}{\longrightarrow} \begin{cases} \nu^{-2}, & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_c \\ 2^{1-\nu} \nu^{-2}, & \text{if } \lambda \ge \lambda_c. \end{cases}$$

Rényi-Wehrl entropy:

$$W_{j,\nu}(\lambda) = \frac{1}{1-\nu} \ln(M_{j,\nu}(\lambda)),$$

Wehrl entropy ($\nu \rightarrow 1$)

$$W_{j}(\lambda) = -\int_{\mathbb{R}^{4}} \frac{d^{2} \alpha d^{2} \beta}{\pi^{2}} \Phi(\alpha, \beta) \ln \Phi(\alpha, \beta) \stackrel{j \to \infty}{\longrightarrow} \begin{cases} 2, & \text{if } \lambda < \lambda_{\alpha} \\ 2 + \ln(2), & \text{if } \lambda \geq \lambda_{\alpha} \end{cases}$$

Growth of zeros of the Husimi distribution and QPT

Husimi density is determined by its zeros through the Weierstrass-Hadamard factorization. The distribution of zeros differs for classically regular or chaotic systems and can be considered as a quantum indicator of classical chaos.

$$\Psi(lpha, \mathbf{z}) = \mathbf{0} \Rightarrow 2\bar{lpha}lpha_{\mathbf{e}} + 2j \ln rac{\mathbf{1} + ar{\mathbf{z}} \mathbf{z}_{\mathbf{e}}}{\mathbf{1} - ar{\mathbf{z}} \mathbf{z}_{\mathbf{e}}} = i\pi(2I+1), \ I \in \mathbb{Z}.$$

Using the approximation $|z\rangle \simeq |\beta\rangle, \ \beta = \sqrt{2j} z$:

$$\Phi(\alpha,\beta) = \mathbf{0} \Rightarrow \mathbf{2}\bar{\alpha}\alpha_{\mathbf{e}} + \mathbf{2}\bar{\beta}\beta_{\mathbf{e}} = i\pi(\mathbf{2}I+\mathbf{1}), I \in \mathbb{Z},$$

$$\alpha_{1} = -\frac{\beta_{e}}{\alpha_{e}}\beta_{1},$$

$$\alpha_{2} = -\frac{\beta_{e}}{\alpha_{e}}\beta_{2} - \frac{\pi}{2\alpha_{e}}(2l+1).$$

直 ア イ ヨ ア イ ヨ ア

Growth of zeros of the Husimi distribution and QPT



Figure: Zeros of the Husimi distribution $\Phi(\alpha, \beta)$ in the cell $\alpha_2, \beta_2 \in [-1, 1]$ of the momentum plane for $\lambda = 0.6, j = 10$ (top-left), $\lambda = 0.6, j = 100$ (top-right), $\lambda = 10, j = 10$ (bottom-left) and $\lambda = 10, j = 100$ (bottom-right) for $\lambda_c = 0.5$.

- C. Emary and T. Brandes, Phys. Rev. E 67, 066203 (2003).
- N. Lambert, C. Emary, T. Brandes, Phys. Rev. Lett. 92, 073602 (2004)
- N. Lambert, C. Emary, T. Brandes, Phys. Rev. A 71, 053804 (2005)
- O. Castaños, E. Nahmad-Achar, R. López-Peña, and J. G. Hirsch, Phys. Rev. A 83, 051601 (2011).
- O. Castaños, E. Nahmad-Achar, R. López-Peña, J. G. Hirsch, Phys. Rev. A 84, 013819 (2011).

- E. Romera, M. Calixto and Á. Nagy, Europhys. Lett. **97**, 20011 (2012).
- M. Calixto, Á. Nagy, I. Paraleda and E. Romera, Phys. Rev. A. 85, 053813 (2012).
- E. Romera, R. del Real and M. Calixto, Phys. Rev. A 85, 053831 (2012)